

1 HONORABLE RONALD B. LEIGHTON  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9

10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28  
29  
30  
31  
32  
33  
34  
35  
36  
37  
38  
39  
40  
41  
42  
43  
44  
45  
46  
47  
48  
49  
50  
51  
52  
53  
54  
55  
56  
57  
58  
59  
60  
61  
62  
63  
64  
65  
66  
67  
68  
69  
70  
71  
72  
73  
74  
75  
76  
77  
78  
79  
80  
81  
82  
83  
84  
85  
86  
87  
88  
89  
90  
91  
92  
93  
94  
95  
96  
97  
98  
99  
100  
101  
102  
103  
104  
105  
106  
107  
108  
109  
110  
111  
112  
113  
114  
115  
116  
117  
118  
119  
120  
121  
122  
123  
124  
125  
126  
127  
128  
129  
130  
131  
132  
133  
134  
135  
136  
137  
138  
139  
140  
141  
142  
143  
144  
145  
146  
147  
148  
149  
150  
151  
152  
153  
154  
155  
156  
157  
158  
159  
160  
161  
162  
163  
164  
165  
166  
167  
168  
169  
170  
171  
172  
173  
174  
175  
176  
177  
178  
179  
180  
181  
182  
183  
184  
185  
186  
187  
188  
189  
190  
191  
192  
193  
194  
195  
196  
197  
198  
199  
200  
201  
202  
203  
204  
205  
206  
207  
208  
209  
210  
211  
212  
213  
214  
215  
216  
217  
218  
219  
220  
221  
222  
223  
224  
225  
226  
227  
228  
229  
230  
231  
232  
233  
234  
235  
236  
237  
238  
239  
240  
241  
242  
243  
244  
245  
246  
247  
248  
249  
250  
251  
252  
253  
254  
255  
256  
257  
258  
259  
260  
261  
262  
263  
264  
265  
266  
267  
268  
269  
270  
271  
272  
273  
274  
275  
276  
277  
278  
279  
280  
281  
282  
283  
284  
285  
286  
287  
288  
289  
290  
291  
292  
293  
294  
295  
296  
297  
298  
299  
300  
301  
302  
303  
304  
305  
306  
307  
308  
309  
310  
311  
312  
313  
314  
315  
316  
317  
318  
319  
320  
321  
322  
323  
324  
325  
326  
327  
328  
329  
330  
331  
332  
333  
334  
335  
336  
337  
338  
339  
340  
341  
342  
343  
344  
345  
346  
347  
348  
349  
350  
351  
352  
353  
354  
355  
356  
357  
358  
359  
360  
361  
362  
363  
364  
365  
366  
367  
368  
369  
370  
371  
372  
373  
374  
375  
376  
377  
378  
379  
380  
381  
382  
383  
384  
385  
386  
387  
388  
389  
390  
391  
392  
393  
394  
395  
396  
397  
398  
399  
400  
401  
402  
403  
404  
405  
406  
407  
408  
409  
410  
411  
412  
413  
414  
415  
416  
417  
418  
419  
420  
421  
422  
423  
424  
425  
426  
427  
428  
429  
430  
431  
432  
433  
434  
435  
436  
437  
438  
439  
440  
441  
442  
443  
444  
445  
446  
447  
448  
449  
450  
451  
452  
453  
454  
455  
456  
457  
458  
459  
460  
461  
462  
463  
464  
465  
466  
467  
468  
469  
470  
471  
472  
473  
474  
475  
476  
477  
478  
479  
480  
481  
482  
483  
484  
485  
486  
487  
488  
489  
490  
491  
492  
493  
494  
495  
496  
497  
498  
499  
500  
501  
502  
503  
504  
505  
506  
507  
508  
509  
510  
511  
512  
513  
514  
515  
516  
517  
518  
519  
520  
521  
522  
523  
524  
525  
526  
527  
528  
529  
530  
531  
532  
533  
534  
535  
536  
537  
538  
539  
540  
541  
542  
543  
544  
545  
546  
547  
548  
549  
550  
551  
552  
553  
554  
555  
556  
557  
558  
559  
5510  
5511  
5512  
5513  
5514  
5515  
5516  
5517  
5518  
5519  
5520  
5521  
5522  
5523  
5524  
5525  
5526  
5527  
5528  
5529  
55210  
55211  
55212  
55213  
55214  
55215  
55216  
55217  
55218  
55219  
55220  
55221  
55222  
55223  
55224  
55225  
55226  
55227  
55228  
55229  
55230  
55231  
55232  
55233  
55234  
55235  
55236  
55237  
55238  
55239  
552310  
552311  
552312  
552313  
552314  
552315  
552316  
552317  
552318  
552319  
552320  
552321  
552322  
552323  
552324  
552325  
552326  
552327  
552328  
552329  
552330  
552331  
552332  
552333  
552334  
552335  
552336  
552337  
552338  
552339  
552340  
552341  
552342  
552343  
552344  
552345  
552346  
552347  
552348  
552349  
552350  
552351  
552352  
552353  
552354  
552355  
552356  
552357  
552358  
552359  
552360  
552361  
552362  
552363  
552364  
552365  
552366  
552367  
552368  
552369  
552370  
552371  
552372  
552373  
552374  
552375  
552376  
552377  
552378  
552379  
552380  
552381  
552382  
552383  
552384  
552385  
552386  
552387  
552388  
552389  
552390  
552391  
552392  
552393  
552394  
552395  
552396  
552397  
552398  
552399  
5523100  
5523101  
5523102  
5523103  
5523104  
5523105  
5523106  
5523107  
5523108  
5523109  
5523110  
5523111  
5523112  
5523113  
5523114  
5523115  
5523116  
5523117  
5523118  
5523119  
55231100  
55231101  
55231102  
55231103  
55231104  
55231105  
55231106  
55231107  
55231108  
55231109  
55231110  
55231111  
55231112  
55231113  
55231114  
55231115  
55231116  
55231117  
55231118  
55231119  
552311100  
552311101  
552311102  
552311103  
552311104  
552311105  
552311106  
552311107  
552311108  
552311109  
552311110  
552311111  
552311112  
552311113  
552311114  
552311115  
552311116  
552311117  
552311118  
552311119  
5523111100  
5523111101  
5523111102  
5523111103  
5523111104  
5523111105  
5523111106  
5523111107  
5523111108  
5523111109  
5523111110  
5523111111  
5523111112  
5523111113  
5523111114  
5523111115  
5523111116  
5523111117  
5523111118  
5523111119  
55231111100  
55231111101  
55231111102  
55231111103  
55231111104  
55231111105  
55231111106  
55231111107  
55231111108  
55231111109  
55231111110  
55231111111  
55231111112  
55231111113  
55231111114  
55231111115  
55231111116  
55231111117  
55231111118  
55231111119  
552311111100  
552311111101  
552311111102  
552311111103  
552311111104  
552311111105  
552311111106  
552311111107  
552311111108  
552311111109  
552311111110  
552311111111  
552311111112  
552311111113  
552311111114  
552311111115  
552311111116  
552311111117  
552311111118  
552311111119  
5523111111100  
5523111111101  
5523111111102  
5523111111103  
5523111111104  
5523111111105  
5523111111106  
5523111111107  
5523111111108  
5523111111109  
5523111111110  
5523111111111  
5523111111112  
5523111111113  
5523111111114  
5523111111115  
5523111111116  
5523111111117  
5523111111118  
5523111111119  
55231111111100  
55231111111101  
55231111111102  
55231111111103  
55231111111104  
55231111111105  
55231111111106  
55231111111107  
55231111111108  
55231111111109  
55231111111110  
55231111111111  
55231111111112  
55231111111113  
55231111111114  
55231111111115  
55231111111116  
55231111111117  
55231111111118  
55231111111119  
552311111111100  
552311111111101  
552311111111102  
552311111111103  
552311111111104  
552311111111105  
552311111111106  
552311111111107  
552311111111108  
552311111111109  
552311111111110  
552311111111111  
552311111111112  
552311111111113  
552311111111114  
552311111111115  
552311111111116  
552311111111117  
552311111111118  
552311111111119  
5523111111111100  
5523111111111101  
5523111111111102  
5523111111111103  
5523111111111104  
5523111111111105  
5523111111111106  
5523111111111107  
5523111111111108  
5523111111111109  
5523111111111110  
5523111111111111  
5523111111111112  
5523111111111113  
5523111111111114  
5523111111111115  
5523111111111116  
5523111111111117  
5523111111111118  
5523111111111119  
55231111111111100  
55231111111111101  
55231111111111102  
55231111111111103  
55231111111111104  
55231111111111105  
55231111111111106  
55231111111111107  
55231111111111108  
55231111111111109  
55231111111111110  
55231111111111111  
55231111111111112  
55231111111111113  
55231111111111114  
55231111111111115  
55231111111111116  
55231111111111117  
55231111111111118  
55231111111111119  
552311111111111100  
552311111111111101  
552311111111111102  
552311111111111103  
552311111111111104  
552311111111111105  
552311111111111106  
552311111111111107  
552311111111111108  
552311111111111109  
552311111111111110  
552311111111111111  
552311111111111112  
552311111111111113  
552311111111111114  
552311111111111115  
552311111111111116  
552311111111111117  
552311111111111118  
552311111111111119  
5523111111111111100  
5523111111111111101  
5523111111111111102  
5523111111111111103  
5523111111111111104  
5523111111111111105  
5523111111111111106  
5523111111111111107  
5523111111111111108  
5523111111111111109  
5523111111111111110  
5523111111111111111  
5523111111111111112  
5523111111111111113  
5523111111111111114  
5523111111111111115  
5523111111111111116  
5523111111111111117  
5523111111111111118  
5523111111111111119  
55231111111111111100  
55231111111111111101  
55231111111111111102  
55231111111111111103  
55231111111111111104  
55231111111111111105  
55231111111111111106  
55231111111111111107  
55231111111111111108  
55231111111111111109  
55231111111111111110  
55231111111111111111  
55231111111111111112  
55231111111111111113  
55231111111111111114  
55231111111111111115  
55231111111111111116  
55231111111111111117  
55231111111111111118  
55231111111111111119  
552311111111111111100  
552311111111111111101  
552311111111111111102  
552311111111111111103  
552311111111111111104  
552311111111111111105  
552311111111111111106  
552311111111111111107  
552311111111111111108  
552311111111111111109  
552311111111111111110  
552311111111111111111  
552311111111111111112  
552311111111111111113  
552311111111111111114  
552311111111111111115  
552311111111111111116  
552311111111111111117  
552311111111111111118  
552311111111111111119  
5523111111111111111100  
5523111111111111111101  
5523111111111111111102  
5523111111111111111103  
5523111111111111111104  
5523111111111111111105  
5523111111111111111106  
5523111111111111111107  
5523111111111111111108  
5523111111111111111109  
5523111111111111111110  
5523111111111111111111  
5523111111111111111112  
5523111111111111111113  
5523111111111111111114  
5523111111111111111115  
5523111111111111111116  
5523111111111111111117  
5523111111111111111118  
5523111111111111111119  
55231111111111111111100  
55231111111111111111101  
55231111111111111111102  
55231111111111111111103  
55231111111111111111104  
55231111111111111111105  
55231111111111111111106  
55231111111111111111107  
55231111111111111111108  
55231111111111111111109  
55231111111111111111110  
55231111111111111111111  
55231111111111111111112  
55231111111111111111113  
55231111111111111111114  
55231111111111111111115  
55231111111111111111116  
55231111111111111111117  
55231111111111111111118  
55231111111111111111119  
552311111111111111111100  
552311111111111111111101  
552311111111111111111102  
552311111111111111111103  
552311111111111111111104  
552311111111111111111105  
552311111111111111111106  
552311111111111111111107  
552311111111111111111108  
552311111111111111111109  
552311111111111111111110  
552311111111111111111111  
552311111111111111111112  
552311111111111111111113  
552311111111111111111114  
552311111111111111111115  
552311111111111111111116  
552311111111111111111117  
552311111111111111111118  
552311111111111111111119  
5523111111111111111111100  
5523111111111111111111101  
5523111111111111111111102  
5523111111111111111111103  
5523111111111111111111104  
5523111111111111111111105  
5523111111111111111111106  
5523111111111111111111107  
5523111111111111111111108  
5523111111111111111111109  
5523111111111111111111110  
5523111111111111111111111  
5523111111111111111111112  
5523111111111111111111113  
5523111111111111111111114  
5523111111111111111111115  
5523111111111111111111116  
5523111111111111111111117  
5523111111111111111111118  
5523111111111111111111119  
55231111111111111111111100  
55231111111111111111111101  
55231111111111111111111102  
55231111111111111111111103  
55231111111111111111111104  
55231111111111111111111105  
55231111111111111111111106  
55231111111111111111111107  
55231111111111111111111108  
55231111111111111111111109  
55231111111111111111111110  
55231111111111111111111111  
55231111111111111111111112  
55231111111111111111111113  
55231111111111111111111114  
55231111111111111111111115  
55231111111111111111111116  
55231111111111111111111117  
55231111111111111111111118  
55231111111111111111111119  
552311111111111111111111100  
552311111111111111111111101  
552311111111111111111111102  
55231111111111111111111110

1 Bayview's Motion for Remand [Dkt. #10], DENIES CWG's Motion to Drop [Dkt. #7], and DENIES all  
 2 motions for terms and fees.

3 **I. BACKGROUND**

4  
 5 This lawsuit arises out of a June 21, 2005, fire loss which occurred in Westport, Washington.  
 6 South Bayview owns the apartment building which was damaged in the fire and was insured by CWG  
 7 when the fire occurred. CWG has allegedly not reached coverage determinations for the majority of the  
 8 claims submitted by South Bayview; South Bayview seeks damages of approximately \$2 million.

9  
 10 On September 1, 2006, South Bayview filed suit in the Superior Court of Washington for Grays  
 11 Harbor County (case number 06-2-01041-4), solely against CWG, for declaratory relief and damages  
 12 under the insurance policy issued by CWG. On October 4, 2006, CWG removed the action to this Court  
 13 on the basis of diversity [Dkt. #1 to 06-05566 RBL]. On October 5, 2006, South Bayview objected to the  
 14 removal, claiming that South Bayview had filed an amended complaint that added HCJ as a non-diverse  
 15 defendant [Dkt. #4 to 06-05566 RBL], and moved to remand [Dkt. #5 to 06-05566 RBL].  
 16  
 17 Notwithstanding this argument, South Bayview filed a voluntary nonsuit [Dkt. #6 to 06-05566 RBL] on  
 18 October 11, 2006.

19  
 20 The following day, South Bayview filed a new action in the Superior Court of Washington for  
 21 Grays Harbor County (case number 06-2-10198-4), adding domestic Defendant HCJ and the ten domestic  
 22 tenant Defendants included in the present suit before this Court. On April 17, 2007, HCJ's counsel advised  
 23 CWG's counsel that South Bayview's original claim against HCJ (failure to provide a certified copy of  
 24 South Bayview's policy) was invalid but that, after discussing the case with South Bayview's counsel, HCJ  
 25 had decided to not actively defend the claim. In response to this conversation with HCJ, on May 21, 2007,  
 26 CWG filed a Partial Motion for Summary Judgment on behalf of HCJ.<sup>1</sup>

---

27  
 28 <sup>1</sup>HCJ did not join in this motion.

1 Without leave of court or of Defendants, South Bayview filed their Amended Complaint adding a  
 2 negligence claim against HCJ on June 6, 2007. The following day, South Bayview filed a Response to  
 3 CWG's Partial Motion for Summary Judgment in which South Bayview did not object to the entry of  
 4 partial summary judgment dismissing South Bayview's original claim against HCJ. The same day, CWG  
 5 removed the matter to this Court, alleging that by not objecting to partial summary judgment, "South  
 6 Bayview implicitly conceded the frivolousness and impropriety of its claim against HCJ." [Dkt. #5 to 07-  
 7 05287 RBL at 5]. In an order dated July 11, 2007, this Court granted South Bayview's motion for  
 8 remand. This Court determined that, while South Bayview had not stated a proper cause of action against  
 9 the individually named defendants, South Bayview's Amended Complaint stated a potentially actionable  
 10 claim of negligence against HCJ that defeated diversity.

13 Upon remand to state court, CWG moved for summary judgment on behalf of HCJ and,  
 14 alternatively, for an order dropping HCJ from the action pursuant to CR 21 [Dkt. #16, p. 1]. In its  
 15 response to these motions, HCJ disclosed a June 7, 2007, agreement between HCJ and South Bayview [*Id.*  
 16 at p. 2]. The Agreement caps South Bayview's recovery at \$5,000 in the event that an eventual judgment  
 17 is entered against HCJ [*Id.* at pp. 4-10].<sup>2</sup> The Agreement also provides that the parties to the Agreement  
 18 will not seek summary judgment, note, or take any depositions; South Bayview also agrees to dismiss HCJ  
 19 in the event that a settlement is reached between South Bayview and CWG [*Id.*].

21 In light of the Agreement, CWG now argues that removal is proper pursuant to 28 U.S.C. §  
 22 1446(b) because the Agreement effectively eliminates HCJ from the action and demonstrates that South  
 23 Bayview has no real intention of prosecuting the action against HCJ.

25 **II. DISCUSSION**

---

27 <sup>2</sup> In a somewhat humorous turn of events, CWG attempted to tender payment of the \$5,000 on HCJ's  
 28 behalf in an effort to effectuate a "settlement" between South Bayview and HCJ [See Dkt. #16, p. 14]. Not surprisingly, South Bayview has not accepted CWG's payment.

1                   **A. Burden of Proof**

2                   Any civil action brought in state court is removable if it might have been brought originally in  
3                   federal court. 28 U.S.C. § 1441(a). If the case stated “by the initial pleading is not removable, a notice of  
4                   removal may be filed within thirty days after receipt by the defendant, through service or otherwise, of a  
5                   copy of . . . [a] paper from which it may be ascertained that the case is one which is or has become  
6                   removable.” 28 U.S.C. § 1446(b). If this Court determines that it is without subject matter jurisdiction at  
7                   any time before the final judgment the action shall be remanded back to the state court. 28 U.S.C. §  
8  
9                   1447(c).

10                  Courts should “rigorously enforce” the legislature’s animus to delimit federal jurisdiction in  
11                  diversity cases. *St. Paul Mercury Indemnity Co. v. Red Cab Co.*, 303 U.S. 283, 288 (1938). Federal  
12                  courts strictly construe their limited jurisdiction. *Lowdermilk v. United States Bank Ass’n*, 479 F.3d 994,  
13                  998 (9th Cir. 2007). There is a strong presumption against removal jurisdiction: federal jurisdiction “must  
14                  be rejected if there is any doubt as to the right of removal in the first instance.” *Gaus v. Miles, Inc.*, 980  
15                  F.2d 564, 566 (9th Cir. 1992) (citing *Libhart v. Santa Monica Dairy Co.*, 592 F.2d 1062, 1064 (9th Cir.  
16                  1979)); *see also Duncan v. Stuetzle*, 76 F.3d 1480, 1485 (9th Cir. 1996). The defendant always bears the  
17                  burden of establishing the propriety of removal. *Duncan*, 76 F.3d at 1485; *Gaus*, 980 F.2d at 566.

18                   **B. Diversity**

19                  28 U.S.C. § 1332 requires complete diversity of citizenship; each of the plaintiffs must be a citizen  
20                  of a different state than each of the defendants. *Morris v. Princess Cruises, Inc.*, 236 F.3d 1061, 1067 (9th  
21                  Cir. 2001). One exception to the requirement of complete diversity is where a non-diverse defendant has  
22                  been “fraudulently joined.” *Emrich v. Touche Ross & Co.*, 846 F.2d 1190, 1193 n.1 (9th Cir. 1988).  
23                  Fraudulent joinder is a “term of art.” *McCabe v. General Foods Corp.*, 811 F.2d 1336, 1339 (9th Cir.  
24                  1987). Joinder of a non-diverse defendant is deemed fraudulent and the defendant’s presence in the lawsuit  
25  
26  
27  
28

1 is ignored for purposes of determining diversity “[i]f the plaintiff fails to state a cause of action against a  
2 resident defendant, and the failure is obvious according to the settled rules of the state.” *Id; see also*  
3 *Martineau v. ARCO Chem. Co.*, 25 F. Supp. 2d 762, 767 (D. Tex. 1998) (holding that to successfully  
4 prove that a non-diverse citizen has been fraudulently joined in order to defeat diversity jurisdiction, the  
5 removing party must demonstrate that there is absolutely no possibility that the plaintiff will be able to  
6 establish a cause of action against the in-state defendant in state court) (internal citation omitted). Joinder  
7 is also deemed fraudulent where the court finds that the plaintiff has no real intention of prosecuting the  
8 action against the resident defendant. *Reeb v. Wal-Mart Stores, Inc.*, 902 F.Supp. 185, 187 (E.D. Mo.  
9 1995). However, merely alleging that an action is likely to be dismissed at some future time against the  
10 defendant does not demonstrate fraudulent joinder. *Diaz v. Allstate Insurance Group*, 185 F.R.D. 581,  
11 586 (C.D. Cal. 1988). “Where it is doubtful whether the complaint states a cause of action against the  
12 resident defendant, the doubt is ordinarily resolved in favor of the retention of the case in state court.”  
13 *Albi v. Street & Smith Publications*, 140 F.2d 310, 312 (9th Cir. 1944).

14         South Bayview advances a number of theories in support of its Motion to Remand. However, after  
15 a thorough review of the record, it is clear that both parties’ motions boil down to an essential essence:  
16 Does the Agreement between South Bayview and HCJ change the Court’s earlier analysis with regard to  
17 whether HCJ was fraudulently joined?

18         The thrust of CWG’s argument, both in its Motion to Drop and in its opposition to South  
19 Bayview’s Motion to Remand, is that the Agreement between South Bayview and HCJ provides clear and  
20 convincing evidence that South Bayview indeed has no real intention to pursue its claims against HCJ and  
21 that HCJ’s continued presence in the action is wholly for the purpose of defeating diversity. As further  
22 evidence that South Bayview has no actual desire to recover from HCJ, CWG points to the disparity  
23 between South Bayview’s potential claimed recovery against HCJ and the capped amount contemplated in  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

1 the Agreement. CWG also cites South Bayview's refusal to accept a \$5,000 "settlement" provided by  
2 CWG on HCJ's behalf.

3 South Bayview's argument regarding the Agreement is two-pronged. First, South Bayview  
4 produces an advice letter from its CPA stating that tax-related benefits will flow to South Bayview in the  
5 event of a large, uncollectible judgment obtained against HCJ. Indeed, both parties devote a substantial  
6 portion of the briefing in this matter to a discussion of whether such benefits are actually available to South  
7 Bayview. Next, South Bayview relies on a case from the Eastern District of Missouri, *Dumas v. Patel*,  
8 317 F.Supp. 2d 1111 (W.D. Mo. 2004), for the proposition that an agreement limiting the recovery from a  
9 defendant (or even eliminating the possibility of recovery altogether) does not constitute a settlement such  
10 that the defendant is removed from the diversity inquiry. Because the Court is persuaded by the *Dumas*  
11 court's reasoning, the Court will not delve into the merits of the tax issue.

12 *Dumas* involved a wrongful death and products liability action (arising from an automobile  
13 accident) that was brought against the non-diverse driver of the other vehicle and the diverse manufacturer  
14 of the decedent's vehicle. *Id.* at 1112. The plaintiffs originally filed suit (in state court) only against the  
15 driver; however, the plaintiffs entered into an agreement with the driver that precluded "any and all  
16 contribution, non-contractual indemnity, or contractual indemnity claims that any defendant may have  
17 against [the driver]." *Id.* at 1114. Plaintiffs also agreed "not to enforce a judgment (or any judgment)  
18 against [the driver] as a result of any judgment" the plaintiffs may have received. *Id.* In return, plaintiffs  
19 received \$50,000 and a promise from the driver to give truthful testimony regarding the accident by  
20 deposition and/or at trial. *Id.* at 1115. Plaintiffs then filed suit against the driver (solely for wrongful  
21 death) and against the manufacturer for product defect and negligence. *Id.* The manufacturer  
22 subsequently sought removal to federal court. *Id.*

1 After acknowledging that the practical consequences of having the driver remain in the suit was  
2 “debatable,” the court refused to second-guess the plaintiffs’ preference to keep the driver as a co-  
3 defendant in court. *Id.* at 1116-17. In remanding the case, the court stated that:  
4

5 Absent joinder of all culpable parties in the litigation, it seems possible that the jury might  
6 be tempted to limit damages or go off on a tangent in assessing fault. Instructions to  
7 disregard [the driver’s] responsibility might not be wholly effective ... Since [the driver]  
8 remains technically exposed to entry of a judgment for his tortious conduct, ... it is not  
necessary that plaintiffs continue to seek serious damages from him, or intend to execute on  
any judgment obtained.

9 *Id.* at 1117.

10 The Court finds this reasoning to be sound. As the Court has already determined, South Bayview  
11 has stated a proper cause of action against HCJ; its claims are neither frivolous or illegitimate. While the  
12 wisdom of the Agreement and the utility of keeping HCJ in the lawsuit is indeed debatable, CWG has not  
13 has not met its burden of establishing that HCJ’s presence is wholly without merit, and the Court cannot  
14 eliminate the possibility of some practical consequence to South Bayview’s strategy. Although the court  
15 may have doubts about the tactics employed, in light of the strict construction of jurisdiction in diversity  
16 cases, this Court will not second-guess South Bayview’s motives in the absence of convincing evidence  
17 that HCJ’s presence in the action is a mere rouse. Consequentially, South Bayview’s Motion to Remand is  
18 GRANTED.

21 **C. Terms and Fees**

22 South Bayview has prevailed on its Motion for Remand [Dkt. #2] and once again seeks an award of  
23 terms and fees pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 11 and 28 U.S.C. §§1446(a) and 1447(c). South Bayview  
24 argues that CWG’s petition for removal was frivolous and not well grounded in existing fact or law and  
25 was brought solely for the improper purpose of delaying state court proceedings [Dkt. #10, p. 12].

The award of fees on a successful motion for remand is discretionary under Fed. R. Civ. P. 11 and 28 U.S.C. §§1446(a) and 1447(c). The Court must determine whether the defendant had objectively reasonable grounds to believe that removal was proper. *See Samura v. Kaiser Foundation Health Plan, Inc.*, 715 F. Supp. 970, 972 (N.D. Cal. 1989). The Court has considered CWG's arguments and has determined that CWG's determination that the Agreement would render the action removable was objectively reasonable. Therefore, South Bayview's request for terms and fees is DENIED.

### III. CONCLUSION

South Bayview's Motion For Remand [Dkt. #10] to Grays Harbor County Superior Court is GRANTED. CWG's Motion to Drop [Dkt. #7] is DENIED. All motions for terms and fees are DENIED.

IT IS SO ORDERED.

Dated this 9<sup>th</sup> day of November, 2007.

Ronald B. Leighton  
RONALD B. LEIGHTON  
UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE